

MINUTES

November 1, 2017

Approved 12/06/17

VISION – QUIETER SKIES FOR OUR COMMUNITIES

MISSION – UTILIZING PARTNERSHIPS TO REDUCE AIRPORT NOISE FOR THE BENEFIT OF NEIGHBORING COMMUNITIES

Chair: Brad Pierce Vice Chair: Katy Brown Treasurer: Jamie Hartig Secretary: Alison Biggs

1. **CALL TO ORDER, ROLL CALL, and QUORUM:** The meeting was called to order at 6:37 p.m. by Chair Brad Pierce.

The following were in attendance:

Arapahoe County:	Kathleen Conti	Cherry Hills Village:	Katy Brown
Douglas County:	Jamie Hartig	Greenwood Village:	Karen Blilie
Douglas County:	Alison Biggs	Lone Tree:	Susan Squyer
Aurora:	Brad Pierce	Parker:	Amy Holland
Castle Pines:	Melissa Coudeyras	ACPAA:	Robert Oislagers
Castle Rock:	Sandy Vossler	AOPA:	Robert Doubek
Centennial:	Andrea Suhaka	CABA:	Don Kuskie

ACPAA Alternate Mike Fronapfel and ACPAA Staff Member Dylan Heberlein were also in attendance.

Those absent were:

<i>Arapahoe County:</i>	Jim Dawkins/Vacant	<i>FAA APA Control Tower:</i>	Jim Borget/Ron Curry
<i>Foxfield:</i>	Dave Goddard/Vacant	<i>FAA District Office:</i>	Linda Bruce/Kandace Krull
<i>CDOT Aeronautics Division:</i>	Todd Green/Vacant	<i>FAA TRACON:</i>	Steve Martin/Bill Dunn

2. **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA:** Katy Brown moved to amend the agenda by adding another opportunity for Public comment following Agenda Item 5. Motion carried. On the motion of Katy Brown, duly seconded, the agenda was approved as amended.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** Diane Reeder from Cherry Hills Village indicated concern about proposed changes to flight paths, and regret that the FAA representatives were not at the meeting. As her comments appeared to fit into the added Public Comment section following agenda item #5, she was asked to hold anything further until that time. This was satisfactory to her.

4. **CONSENT AGENDA:** The Consent Agenda included the October 4, 2017 Draft Minutes and a Treasurer’s Report, dated October 27, 2017. The Treasurer’s Report had not changed from that received at the previous meeting, with total expenses of \$6,260.06 and a balance of \$3,739.94. On the motion of Katy Brown, duly seconded, the Consent Agenda was approved.**

5. **METROPLEX:** Approximately 50 people were present to learn more about Metroplex. Robert Oislagers noted with regret the FAA representatives who had been scheduled to update CACNR about the status of the Denver Metroplex project had unfortunately cancelled their appearance, with no reason given. Those attending had been informed the FAA would not be present, but indicated they were still concerned and wanted information.

Oislagers then provided a summary of Metroplex and its NextGen role in improving efficiency and reducing fuel usage. He also noted the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 (NEPA) which requires federal agencies such as the FAA to disclose to decision makers and the interested public a clear, accurate description of potential environmental impacts of proposed federal actions and reasonable alternatives to those actions.

He compared current flight paths into and out of Centennial Airport with proposed Metroplex routes, and noted that, although the FAA says there will be no environmental impact, the information provided to date does not show where airplanes would transition from the new routes into and out of the airport. This makes it impossible for anyone, including the public, to figure out the actual impact they will have. Examples of places where new routes had been implemented without prior public knowledge or input, such as Phoenix and Los Angeles, were given. The state of Maryland is reportedly planning to sue the FAA soon over this issue.

Oislagers commented the FAA is doing basically nothing to mitigate the effects of Metroplex on the public, and is not being at all transparent in its work with these projects across the country. This appears to demonstrate a major and unfortunate lack of respect for the public and for the effect aircraft noise has on people. The FAA does control the nation’s airspace, and in this area, DIA gets priority on that space.

**Secretary’s Note – Later in the meeting, Don Kuskie noted a need to amend Agenda Item 6.B. The draft minutes indicated he had reported for the Fly Quiet Committee, but he had not been at the meeting and Mike Straka had reported for him. By consensus, the minutes were revisited, and an amendment to that effect was approved.

Centennial Airport had hired Peter Kirsch to represent the airport in 'keeping the FAA honest,' as the FAA does not presently appear to be following either NEPA or its own internal processes in relation to Metroplex. Kirsch is based in Denver, made a presentation to CACNR in 2013, and recently had a 'win' in this matter on behalf of Phoenix. A three judge panel agreed the FAA's actions there were so egregious, the FAA was ordered to redo the project. Other Centennial Airport actions, in addition to bringing Kirsch on board, may include letters and other information sharing with the state's Congressional delegation, and could include a lawsuit.

There would be 30 days for the public to comment on the next information about Metroplex made public by the FAA. Olislagers indicated the airport would provide a draft letter for use during that period, so that the FAA may hear from the maximum number of individuals and jurisdictions.

In closing, Olislagers noted there was another new FAA Regional Administrator here, David Suomi, who had been given a standing invitation to attend a CACNR meeting. Individuals in this position tend to rotate frequently.

Brad Pierce thanked Olislagers for sharing his information and thoughts with CACNR and the audience. He noted his own roles as President of N.O.I.S.E. and in representing environmental (including noise) issues on the NextGen Advisory Committee. As the sole member speaking out for the public's interests related to environmental issues, his role there is challenging. Interestingly, the past Chair of the NextGen Advisory Committee was Richard Anderson, CEO of Delta Airlines; the current Chair is Dave Bronczek, President & COO of FedEx.

6. **SECOND PUBLIC COMMENT OPPORTUNITY:** Numerous members of the public spoke during this time. (The Secretary asks indulgence with the spelling of names, as the sign-in sheet copy was not the most legible.) Most were from various areas of Cherry Hills Village. They included: Alex Thompson; Diane Rader; Lisa D?; Barbara Bush; Bryan Fuller; Brendan Doyle; Kim Beaver; Debbie Stasio; and Mayor Laura Christman. Those who did not speak consistently indicated agreement with the points and concerns being articulated. With no attribution and in no particular order, those sentiments included:

- 1) Agreement with the idea of not moving noise from one area to another
- 2) Frustration because complaints and efforts to achieve relief from noise appear useless
- 3) Moving seems to be the only solution when noise becomes unbearable
- 4) Noise seems to have increased both dramatically and in frequency in recent years
- 5) There would have been greater attendance if the FAA had not canceled – people are interested and concerned

6) Question – how will the public know about the 30-day comment period? Robert Olislagers indicated he will track the FAA's communication about this, convey the information to CACNR, and CACNR Representatives will utilize their methods for getting information out, such as Next Door, HOA's newsletters, etc. As previously noted, he will provide a draft letter to assist those who wish to respond to the FAA.

7) Question – how will the FAA repair negative impacts of its actions? Robert Olislagers indicated there are noise mitigations that can be done with homes, but the FAA has cut way back on its program in that regard. It took federal legislation to achieve the banning of the very noisy Stage 1 and Stage 2 jets. He stated that the best result here would be for the FAA to not implement Metroplex at all!

8) Concern for the quality of life around Centennial Airport, including air quality as well as noise levels, which are the highest since at least 1972. This comment generated a brief discussion of the FAA's use of 65DNL as a measuring point for tolerable noise. As it is an average over a 24 hour period, it does not adequately or accurately represent all the types of offending noise, and tends to bury offenses in the average. There are attempts going on to get the FAA to reconsider its use of the 65DNL.

9) Question – would it be feasible to use eminent domain to prevent residential development in noise sensitive areas? Robert Olislagers indicated land use does present problems, particularly when jurisdictions zone for development in areas which have been identified as problematic, both for safety and noise impacts. However, there have been lawsuits over such 'takings,' and there does not seem to be an easy solution. The use of the airspace has been given to the FAA, and aviation easements are about the best tool available to local airports.

10) Encouragement for everyone to call or communicate with their U.S. Senators and Representatives about this issue, and the FAA. Senator Corey Gardner sits on the Commerce, Science and Transportation Committee which deals with the FAA.

11) The last month or two had been the worst in 25 years, with flights right over the residence and as often as every 3-4 minutes. This area was identified as near Dayton and Orchard.

12) Several had written to DIA asking about Metroplex and were told they had nothing to worry about because they would not be affected in any way. However, nothing was provided to demonstrate those assurances.

13) There was a request for information about the changes which have occurred since Stapleton Airport was closed

14) Whisper kits don't help quiet noisy jets

15) Many more F16s and F18s and other military aircraft seem to be using Centennial Airport. They are very noisy, and the smell of aviation fuel is very evident in some neighborhoods. Robert Olislagers commented about the military being allowed to fly

into any airport in the United States; most are from reserve units, which means many of the pilots may live in the area. Their families can visit them if they fly into Centennial, and they cannot visit at Buckley. It is the end of the year and fuel supply needs to be burned; at the beginning of the year, there will be less of that. There also seemed to be an increase in helicopter training, and they have been asked to do night training at Front Range Airport.

16) There seems to be an increase in corporate jets, and in the size and frequency of many of those jets. Robert Olislagers explained this is a growth market and the airport's role in expediting that growth. He noted that jets are getting quieter, although there is not much progress on making props quieter. When electric planes arrive, they will make no noise.

Karen Blilie, past CACNR Chair, noted she had written an article for NextDoor in Greenwood Village in August about the Metroplex issue. She would see about getting a copy which could be shared with everyone and could be placed on the CACNR website. Dylan Heberlein suggested the use of Twitter and other social media for wide-spread information sharing as well.

For the record, Laura Christman, Mayor of Cherry Hills Village, shared a letter she had written:

"Centennial Airport Roundtable

"November 1, 2017

"Re: NextGen/MetroPlex

"Ladies and Gentlemen:

"Thank you for hosting the public information meeting where FAA representatives were to give an update on Metro/Plex in the Denver Metropolitan region. As you are aware there was significant public interest in this meeting because the location of the pathways has not been identified with adequate specificity for people to determine whether or not they will be impacted.

"As I understand the facts, yesterday morning the day prior to the public hearing, the FAA cancelled its appearance, without giving any reason. The FAA has made it virtually impossible for concerned local governments and citizens to obtain meaningful information concerning the location of flight paths and their associated impacts. This proposed meeting garnered considerable public interest, because it appears that the new pathways may pass directly over existing communities that have never in the past been subjected to significant aviation traffic and noise.

"Studies have shown that noise can cause a negate impact on children in schools, the health of people whose sleep is disturbed and can cause a decrease of 20% or more in the value of homes. No community in the greater Denver Metropolitan area should be subjected to levels of noise described as "intolerable" in communities where Metro/Plex has been implemented.

"The FAA during the process of the environmental report has an obligation to COOPERATE (emphasis added) (i) with local governments having jurisdiction over land uses and having concerns about project-related noise and (ii) with citizens groups having an interest in aircraft noise issues and who have expressed concerns about airport development. I would strongly argue that the abrupt cancellation of the FAA's attendance at the Centennial Airport roundtable is an example of the FAA's continued failure to observe both the spirit and express intent of the regulations. The FAA has interpreted cooperation to mean minimal public input, minimal notice, minimal information and maximum obfuscation.

"I once again want to thank the Centennial Airport Round Table for trying to provide local governments and the public with an opportunity to learn about the current status of MetroPlex directly from the FAA. Your efforts were laudable and my frustration is pointed solely at the FAA.

"Thank you again for all your efforts.

"Laura Christman, Mayor Cherry Hills Village"

Brad Pierce thanked everyone for coming, and for sharing their thoughts. He wanted them to know they were always welcome at a CACNR meeting.

7. **ITEMS REMOVED FROM CONSENT AGENDA:** None

8. **COMMITTEE REPORTS:**

A. **COMMUNITY OUTREACH** – Chair Susan Squyer said the committee would be meeting with the Lone Tree communication manager on raising awareness of the CACNR website's existence. Materials have been added to the website in accordance with recent CACNR minutes.

B. **FLY QUIET** – Chair Don Kuskie noted a need to amend the October minutes which indicated he had reported for the Fly Quiet Committee, but he had not been at the meeting and Mike Straka had reported for him. By consensus, the minutes were revisited, and an amendment to that effect was approved.

C. **NOISE MONITORS** – There had been 30,612 total operations in September, down from 35,641 operations in August and 33,618 in July. Local operations had decreased to 15,044 in September, from 17,458 in August, and 16,681 in July. The year to date lowest local operations – 7,413 - had occurred in June. Year to date operations as of September were 247,306, up from 216,692 in August and 181,053 in July.

In September, there had been 23,996 noise events, compared to 26,218 in August and 22,425 events in July when the Lone Tree monitor had been on-line only sporadically. The lowest number of events so far in 2017 had been in February, at 17,453.

Noise events by decibel range in September were:

17,282 in the 60 – 69 decibel range
5,880 in the 70 – 79 decibel range

775 in the 80 – 89 decibel range
59 in the 90+ decibel range

Total noise events in August 2017 at each monitor were:

8,024 events at the Golf Course monitor on airport property	1,228 events at the Parker monitor
4,460 events at the Meridian monitor	957 events at the Castle Rock monitor
2,589 events at the Airport East monitor on airport property	866 events at the Greenwood Village monitor
2,191 events at the State Park monitor	493 events at the Hunters Hill monitor
1,508 events at the Grandview Estates monitor	235 events at the Castle Pines monitor
1,256 events at the Lone Tree monitor	189 events at the Sagebrush Park monitor

Correlations between noise events at the monitors and noise complaints from the related jurisdictions were not available.

In September, 24 households in Unincorporated Arapahoe County had lodged complaints, followed by 13 households each in both Greenwood Village and Lone Tree; 10 in Unincorporated Douglas County; 4 in Parker; 3 each in both Centennial and Highlands Ranch; 2 in Cherry Hills Village; and 1 each in Aurora, Castle Pines, Denver, and Other for a total of 76 households.

Year to Date, 85 households in Unincorporated Arapahoe County had lodged complaints, followed by 55 in Greenwood Village; 48 in Unincorporated Douglas County; 37 in Centennial; 35 in Lone Tree; 11 each in Denver and Parker; 10 from 'Other'; 8 in Aurora; 7 in Highlands Ranch; 3 in Cherry Hills Village; and 2 in Castle Rock; and 1 in Castle Pines, for a total of 313 households.

699 complaints came from Highlands Ranch in September; 170 from Greenwood Village; 95 from Unincorporated Arapahoe County; 55 from Unincorporated Douglas County; 53 from Lone Tree; 50 from Centennial; 26 from Aurora; 18 from Other; 6 from Parker; 3 from Cherry Hills Village; 2 from Denver; and 1 from Castle Pines, for a total of 1,178 complaints.

Year to Date, 6,352 complaints had come from Highlands Ranch; 1,262 from Greenwood Village; 1,155 from Unincorporated Arapahoe County; 879 from Unincorporated Douglas County; 370 from Centennial; 278 from Lone Tree; 243 from Aurora; 157 from 'Other'; 40 from Parker; 22 from Denver; 9 from Cherry Hills Village; 3 from Castle Rock; and 1 from Castle Pines, for a total of 10,771.

Households which do not show up on the map area but which have registered complaints included Franktown, Elizabeth, Golden, Morrison, North Denver, and Castle Rock. This area in which noise is being complained about seemed to have increased, and staff was asked to do a comparison with 2016 to see if that perception was accurate.

Of the 1,649 complaints lodged in September, there were 1,100 daytime complaints (93.4%), and 78 nighttime complaints (6.6%). Year to Date day – night complaints were 91.44% and 8.55% respectively.

With the complaints from the top complaining household removed, there had been 481 complaints in September, down from 756 complaints in August, and up somewhat from the 434 in September of 2016. Operations in September 2017 had been 30,612, down from 35,639 in August, and up from the 29,414 in September 2016.

In September, with the complaints from the top complainer removed, jets were again responsible for 64% of the complaints by aircraft type; props were responsible for 35%; and helicopters were 1%. Departures continued to account for the most complaints, at 41%, with arrivals at 30%, training at 6%, unknown at 21%; and overflights at 2%.

It was reported there had been 43 requests for a response to noise complaints during the month of September. A September Radar Track Density Map was provided.

There was some discussion of whether CACNR was putting the available noise monitor information to the best use. Ideas included linking monitor information with a variety of other items of interest, such as tracking the effects of individual occurrences, determining what level of noise prompts complaints, relating complaints to the nearest noise monitor, or tracking how many complaints result from each noise event. Aircraft operators whose flights cause frequent complaints, if there are any, might also be approached about voluntarily becoming better neighbors. Brad Pierce indicated he would contact Noise Monitor Committee Chair Jim Dawkins about looking at obtaining this type of information. Looking at what information other airports collect and how they use it might also be helpful

D. WORK PLAN – No Report.

E. STUDY GROUP – The Study Group had been working on the responses to the MOU from the attorneys of the jurisdictions, and was also developing a presentation to take to the various jurisdictions to encourage them to sign the MOU. A draft PowerPoint presentation was provided, which had been done with the assistance of Jason Schwartz of Aviation Compatibility Consulting. He works in cooperation with N.O.I.S.E., and an outline of the types of services he could provide to CACNR once the MOU becomes operational was also provided. Revision and utilization of the CACNR Work Program might also be accomplished,

or whatever other services CACNR might determine useful could be addressed. Question was asked about his fee, which had yet to be determined; it was planned to bring something for CACNR consideration to the next meeting. Reaction to the PowerPoint was positive.

9. **FAA REPORTS:**

- A. **DISTRICT OFFICE** – None.
- B. **APA AIR TRAFFIC CONTROL TOWER** – None.
- C. **TRACON** – None.

10. **OTHER REGULAR MONTHLY REPORTS:**

A. **ARAPAHOE COUNTY PUBLIC AIRPORT AUTHORITY** – Robert Doubek, ACPAA Chair, had provided a written report from the October 12, 2017 ACPAA meeting. He noted Mike Fronapfel had done a good job on behalf of CACNR, in the absence of a CACNR Representative. A copy of the written CACNR report that had been submitted prior to the October ACPAA meeting had been distributed with this meeting's materials.

B. **AIRPORT DIRECTOR'S REPORT** – Robert Olislagers reported new long-range jets were here on demonstration; anything developed after January 1, 2018 will have to be this very quiet Stage 5. He also noted there would be a holiday reception at the CACNR meeting in December.

C. **N.O.I.S.E. & NEXTGEN ADVISORY COMMITTEE** – Brad Pierce had attended the October NextGen meeting, and provided information from that meeting. He felt the group was getting somewhat off track by focusing primarily on the northeast corridor of the country.

Amy Holland indicated she would be able to attend the November N.O.I.S.E. Policy Summit & Community Involvement Workshop in Charlotte, NC.

Information had been provided to CACNR from N.O.I.S.E. about the Air Traffic Noise and Pollution Expert Consensus Act of 2017. The legislation seeks to address community concerns about airplane noise and pollution by requiring the FAA to sponsor an Expert Consensus Report issued by the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering and Medicine on the health effects of airplanes flying over residential areas. Cosponsors of the legislation include Jared Polis (D-CO). The information will be placed on the CACNR website.

The next UC Davis Aviation Noise & Emissions Symposium will be held February 25 – 27, 2018 at the Long Beach Renaissance in Long Beach, California. CACNR has a policy to send two Representatives to this symposium. Brad Pierce asked anyone interested in attending to send him an email. Melissa Coudeyras indicated she would like to attend, if she could make the necessary arrangements for work and home; her attendance, and that of Brad Pierce, for CACNR met with approval. Dylan Heberlein would make room reservations and two symposium registrations by the November 30 deadline, to assure getting sleeping rooms at the symposium headquarters, and the "early bird" registration rate. Attendees would make their own travel arrangements.

11. **OLD BUSINESS:**

A. **CONGRESSIONAL QUIET SKIES CAUCUS** – Nothing new on follow-up to the invitation letter to Congressman Ken Buck. Brad Pierce will continue attempting to accomplish this.

B. **CACNR 2017 MEETING SCHEDULE AND REPRESENTATION TO ACPAA MEETINGS** – CACNR still needed representation for the November 9 ACPAA meeting. Katy Brown indicated she would rearrange her schedule to attend.

C. **AMERICAN ASSOCIATION OF AIRPORT EXECUTIVES** – Dylan Heberlein had attended this conference and indicated the group seemed to be figuring out what it wanted to do. There was considerable discussion about Metroplex, and it had been interesting to hear about that project from the perspective of large commercial airports, which was different than that of Centennial Airport. Discussions also included sound insulation; privatizing air traffic control, and noise research updates. In this latter category, most research seemed to involve jets, with not much being done with props. (Robert Olislagers had not provided the agenda for this meeting to CACNR for its information as promised.) Heberlein recommended looking at the LAX website.

12. **NEW BUSINESS:**

A. **INFORMATION SHARING** – One of the items shared was entitled "Colorado Supreme Court denies hearing Quiet Skies' Longmont airport noise lawsuit." The founder of the Citizens for Quiet Skies group had attended a CACNR meeting about a year ago. The group intends to continue efforts to give communities more local control over GA airports and their resulting noise.

The other article was entitled "New flight paths lead to airplane noise complaints across US." Areas mentioned in the article included Phoenix; Washington, DC's Georgetown; Newport Beach; Laguna Beach; Orange County; Culver City; Maryland areas near Reagan National and Thurgood Marshall Airports; and Santa Cruz.

B. PUBLIC COMMENT: None

C. NEXT MEETINGS:

A. CACNR – December 6, 2017 6:30 p.m. Ramada Hotel & Suites, 7770 South Peoria Street, Englewood, CO
January 3, 2018 6:30 p.m., Ramada Hotel & Suites, 7770 South Peoria Street, Englewood, CO

B. ACPAA – Nov 09, 2017 3:00 p.m. Wright Brothers Room, Centennial Airport, 7800 S. Peoria Street, Englewood, CO
(Katy Brown representing CACNR)
Dec 14, 2017 3:00 p.m. Wright Brothers Room, Centennial Airport, 7800 S. Peoria Street, Englewood, CO
(Jim Dawkins representing CACNR)
Jan 11, 2018 3:00 p.m. Wright Brothers Room, Centennial Airport, 7800 S. Peoria Street, Englewood, CO
(?? representing CACNR)

15. **ADJOURNMENT:** The meeting adjourned at 8:50 p.m.

Alison Biggs, Secretary